



City of Chicago



F2020-65

Office of the City Clerk

Document Tracking Sheet

Meeting Date:	11/16/2020
Sponsor(s):	Dept./Agency
Type:	Report
Title:	Inspector General's follow-up inquiry regarding Department of Assets, Information and Services' maintenance of police vehicles
Committee(s) Assignment:	

NOVEMBER 2020

CITY OF CHICAGO OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF ASSETS, INFORMATION AND SERVICES' MAINTENANCE OF POLICE VEHICLES FOLLOW-UP INQUIRY



JOSEPH M. FERGUSON, INSPECTOR GENERAL FOR THE CITY OF CHICAGO



JOSEPH M. FERGUSON
INSPECTOR GENERAL

CITY OF CHICAGO
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
740 NORTH SEDGWICK STREET, SUITE 200
CHICAGO, ILLINOIS 60654
TELEPHONE: (773) 478-7799
FAX: (773) 478-3949

NOVEMBER 10, 2020

TO THE MAYOR, CITY COUNCIL, CITY CLERK, CITY TREASURER, AND RESIDENTS OF THE CITY OF CHICAGO:

The City of Chicago Office of Inspector General (OIG) has completed a follow-up to its September 2019 Audit of the Department of Fleet and Facility Management's (2FM) maintenance of police vehicles. Based on its responses, OIG concludes that 2FM, which is now part of the Department of Assets, Information and Services (AIS), has fully implemented three out of six audit recommendations, substantially implemented one, partially implemented one, and not implemented one.

The purpose of the 2019 audit was to determine whether 2FM met the industry standard of at least 95% fleet availability. "Availability" is a fleet management performance measure that compares the number of hours a vehicle is expected to be available for use (e.g., eight hours a day) to the actual number of hours it is available. Low vehicle availability could hinder police response and operations, negatively impacting the safety of officers and the public. Our audit found that 2FM could not determine whether it met the industry standard of at least 95% fleet availability because it lacked accurate data, and that 2FM did not perform most preventive maintenance in a timely manner.

Based on the results of the audit, OIG recommended several corrective steps for 2FM to address the data errors that hindered accurate determination of fleet availability. We also recommended that the Department analyze its operations to determine if additional resources were needed. Finally, we recommended that 2FM improve communication with the Chicago Police Department (CPD) to facilitate reaching its preventive maintenance goals. In its response to the audit, 2FM described corrective actions it would take.

In September 2020, OIG inquired about the status of corrective actions taken by AIS. Based on the Department's follow-up response, OIG concludes that AIS has fully implemented three corrective actions, substantially implemented one, partially implemented one, and not implemented one. Specifically, AIS has reconfigured its fleet management software, M5, to reflect the entire time a vehicle is unavailable; provided staff with trainings and monthly reports to address the issue of erroneously

open work orders; identified additional resources needed for timely preventive maintenance; and improved its communication with CPD.

AIS has also prioritized preventive maintenance activities and initiated collaboration with CPD and the Office of Budget and Management, although its efforts in these areas have been hampered by recent civil unrest. OIG urges AIS to implement the remaining recommendations by determining vehicle-specific availability requirements and informing CPD of all vehicles that are overdue for preventive maintenance. Below, we summarize our two audit findings and recommendations, as well as the Department's response to our follow-up inquiry.

We thank the staff and leadership of AIS for their cooperation during the audit and responsiveness to our follow-up inquiries.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'J. Ferguson', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Joseph M. Ferguson
Inspector General
City of Chicago

FOLLOW-UP RESULTS

In September 2020, OIG followed up on its September 2019 Audit of the Department of Fleet and Facility Management's (2FM) Maintenance of Police Vehicles.¹ 2FM, which is now part of Department of Assets, Information and Services (AIS), responded by describing the corrective actions it has taken and providing supporting documentation. Below, we summarize OIG's two findings, the associated recommendations, and the status of AIS' corrective actions. Our follow-up inquiry did not observe or test implementation of the new procedures; thus, we make no determination as to their effectiveness, which would require a new audit with full testing.

FINDING 1:

2FM'S INACCURATE DATA PREVENTED IT FROM DETERMINING FLEET AVAILABILITY.

OIG RECOMMENDATION 1:

OIG recommended that 2FM ensure M5, its fleet management software, includes accurate and up-to-date information regarding when Chicago Police Department (CPD) vehicles should be available. This will allow 2FM to calculate availability of police vehicles based on CPD's operational need. To achieve this goal, 2FM should consider,

- a. developing, in collaboration with CPD, a method of automatically identifying in M5 when CPD vehicles should be available, based on factors such as type and unit assignment; or
- b. delegating authority and responsibility to CPD to enter and maintain this information in M5.

STATUS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION: NOT IMPLEMENTED

In response to the audit, AIS stated that it had worked with CPD and determined that vehicle availability would continue to be reported on a 24-hour basis because all CPD vehicles, regardless of type or unit assignment, must be available at all times. OIG stands by our recommendation that AIS should determine vehicle-specific requirements for availability, because accurate

¹ The 2019 report is available on OIG's website: <https://igchicago.org/2019/09/11/audit-of-the-department-of-fleet-and-facility-managements-maintenance-of-police-vehicles/>.

information is a key to measure the performance of fleet management. Determining whether AIS and CPD are achieving optimal coordination of maintenance efforts requires the departments to reach a shared understanding of which vehicles are truly required to be available, from a CPD operational perspective, at particular times and for particular purposes.

OIG RECOMMENDATION 2:

OIG recommended that 2FM ensure downtime calculations in M5 reflect the entire time that the vehicle is out of service.

STATUS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION: FULLY IMPLEMENTED

AIS stated that it fixed M5 with respect to downtime calculation such that the software now captures the entire time the vehicle is unavailable, including when AIS' garage is closed.

OIG RECOMMENDATION 3:

OIG recommended that 2FM management ensure staff properly open and close work orders in M5. Steps could include updating relevant policies and procedures, training staff, and creating data input controls to make sure work order data entry errors are minimized.

STATUS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION: FULLY IMPLEMENTED

AIS stated that it has trained its managers on relevant procedures for M5 work orders, and that it updates its workorder guidelines as new procedures are put in place.

OIG RECOMMENDATION 4:

OIG recommended that 2FM develop automatic alerts in M5 to notify staff when a work order has erroneously been left open. These alerts could include time parameters for specific job types that notify staff when work orders are open longer than expected. In addition, the regular work order aging reports reviewed by AIS management should include open road service work orders.

STATUS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION: FULLY IMPLEMENTED

In lieu of automatic alerts, AIS stated that it distributes to managers a weekly "30 Day Down Report" tracking vehicles that

have been unavailable for over 30 days. AIS includes open road service work orders in this report.

FINDING 2:

2FM PERFORMED ONLY 12.9% OF PREVENTIVE MAINTENANCE ON TIME.

OIG RECOMMENDATION 1:

OIG recommended that 2FM perform at least 95% of preventive maintenance on time, as recommended by American Public Works Association. To achieve this goal, 2FM should:

- a. Analyze its operations to determine if process improvements could boost its preventive maintenance performance rate; then
- b. Determine if additional capacity—both personnel and facilities—is needed to achieve the goal. 2FM should use this analysis to inform future decision-making related to preventive maintenance, including operating and capital budget requests.

STATUS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION: SUBSTANTIALLY IMPLEMENTED

AIS stated that it has prioritized preventive maintenance activities to help achieve the 95% on-time maintenance goal. As part of its efforts, AIS monitors its on-time maintenance performance and closely works with CPD to better prioritize the most overdue vehicles. Although recent civil unrest disrupted efforts to achieve the goal by halting all preventive maintenance on CPD vehicles for the first two weeks of June, AIS' operational changes have substantially implemented this recommendation. The Department completed 61% of preventive maintenance on time in the first five months of 2020, compared to only 12.9% of maintenance completed on time in 2017.

Further, AIS conducted a personnel analysis that showed a need for 14 more technicians. The Department also analyzed the vehicles that urgently needed replacement and provided the Office of Budget and Management (OBM) with a "2020 CPD vehicle replacement plan" that included replacement of 1,450 (or 47%) of the 3,089 active vehicles, at a cost of \$56 million.

OIG RECOMMENDATION 2:

OIG recommended that to improve its communication with CPD regarding the police fleet, 2FM:

- a. Inform CPD, on at least a weekly basis, of all vehicles that are due or past due for maintenance. 2FM could accomplish this by initiating automatic notifications, via M5, to allow CPD to coordinate delivery of vehicles for preventive maintenance.
- b. Discontinue the practice of limiting the number of vehicles requested each week, and inform CPD of which vehicles are longest overdue so that they can be prioritized.
- c. Resume regular meetings of the Interagency Police Vehicle Committee with CPD and OBM.

STATUS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION: PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED

AIS provides CPD with a weekly list of 300 vehicles that should be brought in for service, prioritizing those most overdue. Although AIS has not established automatic notifications, it electronically sends the list. AIS has also implemented incentives (e.g., restriction on fuel transactions for recurrent “no-show” vehicles) to boost CPD’s compliance with preventive maintenance appointments.

AIS continues to limit the number of vehicles requested for preventive maintenance. It stated that it “does not schedule any vehicles in excess of its capacity.” While it is prudent to limit requests to capacity, we encourage AIS to notify CPD of all vehicles that are overdue for maintenance in order to give CPD a complete view of all vehicle maintenance needs and facilitate planning.

Regarding interdepartmental cooperation, AIS held a meeting with CPD, OBM, and the Fraternal Order of Police on November 19, 2019, to discuss issues with preventive maintenance. Although AIS could not regularly convene meetings with all members due to circumstances related to COVID-19 and civil unrest, it resumed discussions with CPD and OBM on a monthly basis starting in September 2020.

MISSION

The City of Chicago Office of Inspector General (OIG) is an independent, nonpartisan oversight agency whose mission is to promote economy, efficiency, effectiveness, and integrity in the administration of programs and operations of City government. OIG achieves this mission through,

- administrative and criminal investigations by its Investigations Section;
- performance audits of City programs and operations by its Audit and Program Review Section;
- inspections, evaluations and reviews of City police and police accountability programs, operations, and policies by its Public Safety Section; and
- compliance audit and monitoring of City hiring and human resources activities and issues of equity, inclusion and diversity by its Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Compliance Section.

From these activities, OIG issues reports of findings and disciplinary and other recommendations,

- to assure that City officials, employees, and vendors are held accountable for violations of laws and policies;
- to improve the efficiency and cost-effectiveness of government operations; and
- to prevent, detect, identify, expose, and eliminate waste, inefficiency, misconduct, fraud, corruption, and abuse of public authority and resources.

AUTHORITY

OIG's authority to produce reports of its findings and recommendations is established in the City of Chicago Municipal Code §§ 2-56-030(d), -035(c), -110, -230, and 240.

Cover image courtesy of iStock.

PROJECT TEAM

JISUNG SHIN, PERFORMANCE ANALYST
CAMERON LAGRONE, CHIEF PERFORMANCE ANALYST
LISE VALENTINE, DEPUTY INSPECTOR GENERAL

PUBLIC INQUIRIES:

NATALIE A. KURIATA: (773) 478-8417 | NKURIATA@IGCHICAGO.ORG

TO SUGGEST WAYS TO IMPROVE CITY GOVERNMENT, VISIT:
IGCHICAGO.ORG/CONTACT-US/HELP-IMPROVE-CITY-GOVERNMENT

TO REPORT FRAUD, WASTE, AND ABUSE IN CITY PROGRAMS:
CALL OIG'S TOLL-FREE TIP LINE: (866) 448-4754 / TTY: (773) 478-2066

OR VISIT OUR WEBSITE

IGCHICAGO.ORG/CONTACT-US/REPORT-FRAUD-WASTE-ABUSE/